Exploring suicidal behaviours by probation clients—a qualitative near-lethal study
Mackenzie, J.-M., Borrill, J. and Cartwright, T.

This is a pre-copy edited, author-produced PDF of an article accepted for publication in the The Journal of Public Health following peer review.


https://dx.doi.org/10.1093/pubmed/fdx005

The WestminsterResearch online digital archive at the University of Westminster aims to make the research output of the University available to a wider audience. Copyright and Moral Rights remain with the authors and/or copyright owners.

Whilst further distribution of specific materials from within this archive is forbidden, you may freely distribute the URL of WestminsterResearch: (http://westminsterresearch.wmin.ac.uk/).

In case of abuse or copyright appearing without permission e-mail repository@westminster.ac.uk
Exploring Suicidal Behaviours by Probation Clients – A Qualitative Near-Lethal Study

Journal: Journal of Public Health
Manuscript ID: JPH-16-0331.R1
Manuscript Type: Original Article
Date Submitted by the Author: 04-Dec-2016
Complete List of Authors: Mackenzie, Jay-Marie; University of Westminster Faculty of Science and Technology, Psychology; Cartwright, Tina; University of Westminster, Psychology; Borrill, Jo; University of Westminster, Psychology
Keywords: Mental health, Prisons
Exploring Suicidal Behaviours by Probation Clients – A Qualitative Near-Lethal Study

J. C. Mackenzie*, Senior Lecturer, Department of Psychology, University of Westminster, London, W1W 6UW, United Kingdom

T. Cartwright, Senior Lecturer, Department of Psychology, University of Westminster, London, W1W 6UW, United Kingdom

J. Borrill, Senior Lecturer, Department of Psychology, University of Westminster, London, W1W 6UW, United Kingdom

*Corresponding Author email address: J.C.Mackenzie@westminster.ac.uk
Abstract

**Background:** Existing research emphasises that offenders serving community based sentences are at an increased risk of suicide compared with the general population, however there is little understanding about the causes of this risk. The aim of the current research was to understand how to support probation clients and prevent suicide, by exploring the experiences of probation clients who carried out near-lethal suicide attempts whilst under probation supervision.

**Methods:** In-depth interviews were carried out with seven probation clients who made near-lethal suicide attempts whilst serving a probation sentence. Data were analysed using Interpretative Phenomenological Analysis.

**Results:** Participants recounted negative experiences which they perceived to be linked to their suicidal feelings and behaviours, such as experiencing bereavements, perceived loss of control over their mental state or situation, and difficulties relating to stages of their probation sentence. Participants expressed severe difficulties with trusting authorities, making disclosure of suicidal feelings problematic. However, participants emphasised the role that purposeful and meaningful activity can play in suicide prevention.

**Conclusions:** Suicide prevention strategies must be tailored to the needs of probation clients across the UK. Mandatory training for probation staff is recommended to help reduce suicides, and support from external agencies should be sought where possible.
Suicide is a major public health problem that is estimated that a suicide occurs every 4 seconds worldwide. Suicide prevention strategies are often tailored to meet the needs of the most at risk groups, including offenders who are particularly at risk of dying by suicide. Whilst suicides in prisons have gained a considerable amount of attention from researchers and policy makers, offenders serving probation sentences have been neglected, despite their elevated risk of suicide. The UK probation system has recently undergone dramatic changes, with the division between ‘low – medium risk’ offenders, including those on licence from prison, now being supervised by privately run Community Rehabilitation Companies (CRCs) and ‘high risk’ offenders, including those living in approved premises, being supervised by the government funded National Probation Service (NPS). Given these changes it is now unclear how this will effect offender access to mental health support, thus developing suicide prevention initiatives is imperative.

In terms of research, some focus has been given to the recently released prison population who are also at an increased risk of suicide and. Recent large scale studies in the UK and Denmark have investigated the association between suicide and contact with the Criminal Justice System (CJS). Both studies suggest that those who have been in contact with the Criminal Justice System (CJS), including probation services, have a higher risk of suicide than the general population. However, these studies cannot provide specific suicide risk information about those serving community sentences. Arguably, more useful are studies that focus on establishing suicide rates in probation only populations, which indicate that probation clients are 7-9 times more likely to die from suicide than the general population. However, such studies cannot explain the potential causes for this increased risk, although one study did suggest that psychiatric illness may be associated with suicide risk.

Research has thus started to focus on the potential risk factors associated with suicide, suicide attempts and suicidal ideation by probation clients. These findings suggest an association between suicide attempts and a history of self-harm and suicidal behaviour, particularly recent self-harm, similar to the general population. More recently, quantitative research into self-harm and suicide by probation clients in Iowa, USA found that childhood trauma and exposure to accidental traumatic injury increased the chance of suicidal ideation, self-harm and attempted suicide. Furthermore, depression was linked to suicidal ideation and
suicide attempts, panic disorder was linked to self-harm, and drug dependence was linked to increased suicidal ideation. These studies demonstrate the problem of suicide by probation clients, yet they provide very little insight into what can be done to prevent suicide in this population. Therefore, in order to further tailor suicide prevention policy, in-depth analysis is needed to understand suicidal behaviour in the context of the community supervision process, i.e. to identify which aspects of serving a probation sentence or living in supervised community premise, relates to suicidal behaviour. Of equal importance is the need to identify perceived ways of preventing suicide, yet to be explored by researchers. Therefore, using a qualitative approach, the aim of the current study was to explore the experiences of probation clients who carried out near-lethal self-injury whilst serving a community based sentence. Near-lethal suicides are those that could have been completed suicides but for some form of intervention, medical or otherwise, regardless of the individual’s intentions and are valuable for understanding how to reduce and prevent suicide.

Methods

Ethical approval was gained via the University of Westminster Ethics Committee and London Probation Trust. Informed consent was gained from all participants and participants were aware that they could withdraw from the interview at any time. Each participant was ascribed a pseudonym and potentially identifying information was removed in order to ensure the participants’ anonymity.

Participants were recruited from London Probation areas, using purposive sampling, prior to the changes to the current probation system. All participants had carried out a near-lethal act within 12 months whilst serving a probation sentence. Of ten potential participants, two were deemed too vulnerable to participate and one declined. Potential participants were identified and referred by staff acting as gatekeepers. Staff provided potential participants with a study information sheet and they had an opportunity to meet the researcher and ask questions before deciding to take part. A visual analogue scale was used to monitor the participant’s emotional state before and after the interview. JM conducted all interviews which lasted 50 -
90 minutes. The semi-structured interview schedule was developed from previous interview questions used for near-lethal attempters and in collaboration with the London Probation Suicide and Self-harm Prevention Forum. Questions were open ended, encouraging free recall by the participants and focused on understanding how clients experienced their suicidal state, what meaning this event had for them, and how they perceived this in relation to their probation process. Interviews were recorded and transcribed verbatim.

Data were analysed using interpretative phenomenological analysis (IPA), an idiographic qualitative methodology concerned with the in-depth examination of the lived experience, with a focus on sense making and meaning. The objective of the IPA researcher is to engage with, and explore in detail, a person’s reflections, thoughts, and feelings about a major life event such as a suicide attempt. Thus IPA was deemed an appropriate method for the current study as it allows participants to provide valuable insights into their own suicide attempt, how they perceive this attempt, and how they make sense of their experience. IPA is an iterative process which can be grouped broadly into four main stages: 1) Initial encounter with text and note taking; 2) Identification of preliminary themes; 3) Collating and grouping of themes into concepts/clusters, and identification of possible superordinate themes; 4) Producing a summary table of themes. Initial analysis was carried out on a single case by JM, then subsequent cases to check for similarities and differences, and new emerging themes, and discussed with the co-authors. Analysis was subsequently carried out on all cases building on the original case, and emerging themes were re-checked against all interviews, and discussed and checked for consistency with the co-authors.

Findings
From the qualitative analysis of the participants’ interviews four master themes were found: Experience of Loss; Difficulties with Trust; Control: Loss and Regain; and Struggles to find a purpose.

Experiences of Loss
Many participants spoke of having to deal with on-going turmoil related to loss; for several participants this was traumatic and burdensome. Loss embodied different forms including loss of key relationships, support from others and bereavements. Experiences of loss had a long lasting emotional impact contributing towards feelings of despair during episodes of
For Peer Review

self-harm or suicide attempts. For example, Box 1.1 shows that Josh’s experience of losing his partner after a break up also meant the loss of emotional support.

The most significant form of loss was bereavement. Whilst common, participants found bereavements particularly difficult to manage especially during their probation process. Participants’ experience of bereavement frequently compounded their current stressful situations and emotional turmoil. As illustrated in Box 1.2 bereavement meant the removal of further sources of support, with several participants referring to bereavements as causing on-going trauma and pain, contributing towards their suicidal feelings.

Difficulties with trust

Participants’ reactions to trust and trust building were complex, with many struggling to fully embrace trusting relationships through fear of rejection and being hurt. Furthermore, participants’ exposure to negative experiences led to a general distrust in authority and the CJS. Kathy’s quote in Box 2.1 illustrates the difficulties participants faced with re-gaining trust following negative experiences. For Kathy, even the positive relationship with her probation officer could not change her views on ‘the system,’ and the phrase ‘I don’t have time for them’ suggests she is unwilling to engage with or trust anyone considered to be part of ‘the system.’ Thus lack of trust led to difficulties with building relationships with their probation officers and more significantly made it less likely that participants would disclose their suicidal feelings to anyone they perceived as ‘authority.’

However, what stood out as especially important were the times when participants were able to gain trust in others and how this trust developed. Gaining and re-building trust often revolved around key sources of support. Development of trust in others was aided by the participant having a feeling of being cared for, being listened to, being made to feel important, and not having their concerns dismissed. Overall participants described trust as fragile but something that could be repaired if broken. For example, Dave’s overwhelming sense of mistrust and feelings of injustice were scattered throughout his account, however, Dave referred to one example of how his probation officer had restored some of his trust in ‘authorities’ (Box 2.2). Dave’s account demonstrates how the action of his probation officer restored his trust in others and provided him with a valuable source of support, enabling him to open up to her about his suicidal feelings. Additionally, experiencing a sense of being cared for had a powerful effect on other participants in relation to trust building and disclosure of suicidal feelings.
Control: loss and regain

Prior to their suicide attempts, participants experienced a loss of control throughout many areas of their lives, ranging from their jobs and family life to their mental state. This loss of control was often unexpected and unanticipated. For example, Dave referred to himself as ‘running around like a headless chicken’ in the days leading up to his suicide attempt. Participants shared similar maladaptive ways of coping with their loss of control such as alcohol use, which commonly resulted in negative outcomes and added to their already chaotic and adverse situations (Box 3.1).

Participants referred to losing control of their life situation prior to their suicide attempt, and often described this in relation to the probation process. Box 3.2 illustrates Dan explaining how his suicidal feelings were triggered by his upcoming court date.

However, some participants were able to identify particular aspects of their lives that they were able to regain control over. For example, Josh acknowledges that he had lost control over his self-harm, but was able to regain control due to a ‘thinking skills’ programme run by Probation. Josh’s account demonstrates how the introspective skills that he developed during the programme enabled him to identify the triggers for his self-harm and prevent it from re-occurring (Box 3.3).

Struggles to find a purpose

Participants frequently referred to their struggles in trying to find a meaningful and purposeful life. Periods when they lacked achievement and felt hopeless about the future were accompanied by suicidal feelings and depression. A continued search for a purpose to live were reflected in all participants’ accounts. Some participants spoke of how having a job could provide both purpose and stability (Box 4.1).

Interestingly other participants felt that a purpose could be found through helping others, particularly by helping those in situations similar to their own, even if they were not currently in a position to do this (Box 4.2). For Kathy, taking part in the current research project provided her with purpose. Her use of the term ‘people like me’ reflects the idea that shared and common experience provides a capability to empathise and understand others going through similar situations. Sharing these experiences with others in similar circumstances was commonly discussed by participants as helpful for those who feel suicidal, and was perceived to combat the isolation and loneliness that many participants experienced when
feeling suicidal. Searching for meaning and purpose commonly involved trying to find employment and develop social relationships. At times when participants had a perceived purpose, their suicidal feelings lessened. Additionally, feeling needed by their family, pets or friends also lessened suicidal feelings. Furthermore, Box 4.3 illustrates that, for some participants, the process of getting to know themselves and understand their depression also played an important role in their journeys of recovery.

Discussion

Main findings of this study

The current findings provide insight into the reasons probation clients might carry out near-lethal behaviour and what can be done to support these clients. Findings indicate that clients’ suicidal states were strongly related to the experience of loss, including bereavement. At the time of their attempts, clients experienced a loss of control over their lives and in many cases their mental state. When clients felt suicidal they often struggled to open up to others about their feelings, despite acknowledging the value of talking to others about their problems and concerns. However, clients typically found it difficult to share their feelings with authority figures due to pre-existing difficulties in trusting others and cynicism about the CJS. However, when trusting relationships were established this enabled clients to speak more openly about their concerns which eased their suicidal feelings. Additionally, clients also spoke of the importance of having a meaningful and purposeful life. When clients felt a sense of purpose in their lives, through employment or feeling valued by their family/friends, they were less likely to feel suicidal, whereas near-lethal acts occurred at times when they lacked meaning and purpose.

What is already known about this topic

This study adds to a growing body of evidence highlighting the problem of suicide and suicidal behaviours by probation clients, something previously neglected in the literature. A handful of researchers have attempted to understand why this group are particularly vulnerable to suicidal behaviours and suggest that mental illness, previous childhood trauma and having a history of suicide attempts and self-harm may contribute towards future suicide attempts and eventual suicide. Some studies have aimed to gain more understanding of this issue by researching probation staff experiences of managing
suicidal probation clients. Yet a gap exists in the literature in relation to what is known about the causes and how this relates to the probation process, and what can be done to prevent suicide in this group of individuals in a particular context.

What this study adds

This is the first qualitative study to be carried out with probation clients who have carried out near-lethal self-injury. An important finding of this research is that participants struggled to express and manage their experiences of loss both prior to their probation sentence and whilst serving their sentence. This was reported as directly contributing towards participants’ suicidal feelings, yet not previously identified within the literature. Loss was experienced in a number of ways, including loss of social support of friends and family; anticipated loss of freedom and/or loved ones; and bereavement. Participants struggled to maintain key relationships, thus the loss of a significant relationship was doubly damaging. These findings draw attention to the lack of support for probation clients who have suffered a loss, and the lack of literature recognising this issue in relation to suicide. More significantly these findings highlight the need for recognition amongst probation staff that clients who have recently suffered a bereavement may need extra support, particularly at key stages of the probation process when further losses may be anticipated by clients.

Furthermore, findings demonstrate that probation client’s suicidal states possibly relate to a perceived loss of control over both their mental state and broader life situation. Feeling out of control led to feelings of hopelessness and preoccupation with suicide as the only solution or way out. Particularly novel was how this perceived loss of control sometimes related to the probation process itself, such as awaiting a court sentence. Their struggle to gain control often appeared to result in the use of maladaptive strategies including using alcohol and self-harm to block out or deal with emotions, often further fuelling their depression and suicidal feelings. Our previous research with probation staff indicates that untrained staff may not be aware of these issues in relation to suicidal behaviours, therefore raising awareness could help to reduce suicide in this population. However, given the difficulties this group of participants face with trusting others, their ability to open up to others and talk through their problems to explore more adaptive ways of coping was limited. Findings from the current research suggest that a lack of trust could create barriers for probation clients to share and explore their suicidal feelings therefore potentially making it more difficult for staff
to identify those at risk of suicide. Thus in order to engage clients, suicide training for staff should help highlight these difficulties.

It is not surprising that the participants’ expressed difficulties with trusting others, given that suicide attempters and suicide completers tend to demonstrate a social disconnection from others, and offenders in particular face difficulty in trusting authority even if they are in a helping role such as a therapist. However, the current research demonstrates how these difficulties with trust can intensify the suicidal spiral, but at the same time how trust can gradually be gained and re-built. Participants’ accounts suggested that building trusting relationships enabled them to talk through their problems, increased their capacity to reflect on their feelings and made them better equipped to handle emotional turmoil. Trust in their offender manager or other key individuals, was viewed by participants as key to feeling able to disclose their suicidal feelings and behaviours.

Surprisingly unexplored in the literature is how suicide by probation clients can be prevented. Using first-hand accounts, the current study was able to provide greater insight into what can moderate suicidal feelings. For example, having a meaningful and purposeful life affirmed the participants’ self-value and worth, providing them with a reason to live. Meaning was gained in a number of ways including positive relationships, jobs, family, having a home, providing the participants with a sense of belonging. In contrast, lack of meaning contributed to feelings of isolation, worthlessness and depression. Therefore suicide prevention strategies could encompass information about how purposeful and meaningful activities can be achieved by clients in these settings.

Limitations of this study

Despite the importance of these findings it is necessary to note several limitations. Given the participants’ difficulties with trust, particularly authority figures, they may not have disclosed all feelings about their near-lethal behaviour to the interviewer. However, the depth of the data suggests that participants were open about their suicidal experiences, also reflected in their positive comments about taking part in the research. As with other qualitative studies with suicide attempters, participants’ accounts were retrospective and may have been subject to memory bias or interference. Arguably, however, it would be difficult to capture the feelings, emotions and intensity of these experiences if a qualitative approach were not employed. Furthermore due to the difficulties with accessing and recruiting this population, the sample size was small. Additionally the current research was carried out in and limited to...
one probation area. Future research should consider different probation areas such as those in more rural settings, where clients may have different experiences.

Conclusions and policy recommendations

Training about suicide currently exists for probation staff in some, but not all areas of the UK, however training is often not mandatory and with increasing staff caseloads, staff struggle to complete it. London Probation have used the findings from the current research as part of their currently run mandatory training for all Approved Premises staff, covering issues relating to both bereavements and disclosure. Thus given the increased risk of suicide by probation clients, as well as the dramatic changes to the probation system in the UK, it is vital that suicide prevention strategies be tailored to meet the specific needs of probation clients and for staff training to be applied consistently throughout the UK. The current work suggests that policy interventions should be designed with a focus on how to support these clients at particularly turbulent stages of their probation process, such as awaiting a court sentence. Furthermore both NPS and CRC’s all probation staff should be trained to support clients that have the courage and trust to disclose their suicidal feelings. It is recommended that probation prevention initiatives focus on how to provide support should be provided in relation to issues that, on the surface may not appear to relate to suicidal feelings, such as suffering a significant loss or bereavement, or employing maladaptive coping mechanisms like alcohol, to raise awareness amongst staff that these issues could possibly be a risk for suicide. Furthermore initiatives and training could help to highlight the importance probationers may find it difficult to attain meaning in key areas such as finding employment, permanent housing, and social support systems. The current research demonstrates the contributory role that probation can play in providing a sense of purpose, such as enrolling clients onto relevant courses or helping them to find employment or voluntary work. Finally it would be beneficial for probation to make use of existing external sources of support, such as the Samaritans, who can provide support independently of the CJS, thus potentially eliminating client difficulties with trust. Such partnerships already successfully exist in the UK prison system in the form of the Samaritans Listener Scheme, therefore a similar approach could be adapted for probation settings, such as the use of Samaritans Outreach teams.
13. King C. A National Study of Suicide and Recent Contact with the Criminal Justice System: The University of Manchester; 2012.
17. Pritchard C, Cox M, Dawson A. Suicide and violent death in a six-year cohort of male probationers compared with pattern of mortality in the general population: evidence of


44. Cook LC. London Probation Suicide Prevention Training. 2015.


Acknowledgements

We are grateful for the help of Amy Beck, and Lisa Cook at the National Probation Service for their ongoing help with organizing this research. We would also like to thank the Sir Halley Stewart Trust for the financial contribution that has enabled us to reimburse our participants’ and researchers’ travel expenses.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pseudonym</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Age</th>
<th>Ethnicity</th>
<th>Method of Near-lethal Act</th>
<th>Past self-harm and/or Suicide Attempts</th>
<th>Offence Type</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dave</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>White British</td>
<td>Cutting</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Shoplifting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kathy</td>
<td>F</td>
<td>37</td>
<td>White British</td>
<td>Cutting</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Assault on a police officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freddie</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>White Irish</td>
<td>Jumping from a Height</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Common Assault</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dan</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>White British</td>
<td>Attempting to Jump in Front of Train</td>
<td>N</td>
<td>Common assault</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Roy</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>60</td>
<td>White British</td>
<td>Overdose</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Attempted murder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mike</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>White British</td>
<td>Fire Setting</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Shop lifting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Josh</td>
<td>M</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>White British</td>
<td>Cutting</td>
<td>Y</td>
<td>Burglar, Non-dwelling</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Table I. Participant Demographics*
### Box 1 Experiences of Loss

1.1 Interviewer: ...when you felt suicidal or depressed have you ever been able to talk to anyone about it?
Josh: I’d say the only person I could open up to was my ex-girlfriend because I was with her for a few years so she saw me at my best and my worse and it was just easier for me to talk than allow it to get to the worse… But since me and her broke up not really. *(Josh)*

1.2 I’m closer to my dad in death than I was ever close to him in life, you know. Completely I feel, I feel that he is always part of me. Erm, I never stopped speaking to him, I’m always speaking to him. I feel haunted by him, and I just, just the way it ended and yeah, yeah just haunted by him. I feel he is angry at me. I feel he is lost. *(Freddie)*
Box 2 Difficulties with Trust

2.1 I’ve got no time for the system I’m sorry. Do you know what I mean. I’m not saying XXX (Probation Officer) is like that, because she is fair to me but the old bill. I don’t have time for them. (Kathy)

2.2 You know when she (probation officer) first mentioned it ‘we will see if we can get you some money for clothes’ and I thought yeah right, okay mate what do you think that I was born yesterday, and then it happened and I thought no way it’s someone who actually, you are as good as their word, they mean what they say, they stick to it and they really really want to help me, there was nothing in it for her, she didn’t have to do that. But she did just to help me and I was like what! (Dave)
### Box 3 Control: loss and regain

| 3.1 | I was self-medicating by drinking to lift myself as if like it’s a bottle of anti-depressants... To be fair for a couple of hours it is, but long term it’s a depressant. Although I’m trying to lift myself with this short term miracle, long term it was doing me more damage because it was pushing me lower and lower. (Dave) |
| 3.2 | I was worried about going to prison basically. Leaving my kids, that’s the hard thing, that’s what I was worried about… It was more worry that made me want to escape.” (Dan) |
| 3.3 | It’s helped me control my emotions, work out how I can stop certain things from happening, like in the case of the self-harming work out the triggers so… I can nip it in the bud before it gets that bad that I have no control over what’s going on. (Josh) |
Box 4 **Struggles to find a purpose**

| 4.1 | If I say I’ve been doing a plumbing course, that would be, I’d be doing that course but that would be the future to work in as well. (Dan) |
| 4.2 | …if I could do this, get off the drink and go and work with people like me. And then I could give it back to society… why do you think that I don’t mind helping you out… I feel better because I am helping someone out there. (Kathy) |
| 4.3 | …mixing my work and my poetry, my meditation. And that’s its and my family… Once you do get into something like CBT, Buddhism or whatever, finding a way through the talking therapies, through your issues, is remarkably successful. As soon as we abandon our obsession of feeding people with chemicals… that’s been an appalling waste of time in my life. (Roy) |